

UNITED STATES PATTERN COINS DEVIATING FROM "THE RULE OF 13 STARS"

BY

JOHN H. MACMILLAN Ph.D.

In three earlier articles this author has presented analyses of both federal and non federal U.S. coin issues containing either less or more than 13 stars. 13 stars, the number representing the original 13 colonies, became the "generic" number of stars in 1796, when the admittance of Tennessee to the Union made adding stars for each additional state impractical on small diameter issues. The first article listed federal issues deviating from "the rule" and their significance, while the second analyzed high denomination territorial gold, Confederate half dollars and hard times tokens. The third article analyzed California small denomination gold coins from the 1853-57 era. This article, the last of the series, presents the author's analysis of U.S. pattern coins, the 'might have beens', as extracted from the latest addition of Judd's classic work "United States Pattern, Experimental and Trial Pieces" by J. Hewitt Judd, MD. " These comprise all denominations and all metals for each trial piece, with an appropriate "Judd" number for each metal. In the earlier articles this author identified six types of coins deviating from "the rule of 13 stars"

Type A: Number of states in the union the year the coins was struck.

Type B: A state's order in its ratification of the Constitution.

Type C: A state's order in joining the union after the Constitution was ratified.

Type D: Number of states in the union at the start of the Lewis and Clark Expedition in 1804.

Type E: Probably artistic license.

Type F: Probably Mint error.

Analysis of the Judd text revealed no examples of types B or C, which is not surprising since pattern's are not generally commemoratives or state quarters. Type F was also not identified. Type A was illustrated nicely by the classic dollar patterns of Gobrecht dated 1836 (Judd numbers 60-62), 1838 (Judd 88-9) and 1839 (Judd 108-9). Twenty six stars on the reverse represent all 26 states in the Union in the late 1830's. Other very nice examples are the "Goloid" silver dollar patterns of 1878 (Judd 1557-9, 1563-4), 1879 (1626-34) and 1880 (Judd 1651-6). All show 38 stars on the reverse, each star representing one of the 38 states in the Union in that era. Type E, "artistic license", was shown by a very large number of patterns in the 1870's, the most famous being the four dollar gold "Stella's" (Judd 1635 through 1641) for 1879 and Judd

1657 through 1662 for 1880. They show one very large star on the reverse. Many other patterns, mostly half dollar and dollar denominations from the 1870's, show two added "artistic license", stars on the reverse. Much more interesting examples are cent (Judd 119-124) patterns of 1850 and two cent (Judd 305-8) patterns of 1863, all of which show two prominent stars on the obverse. Type D was found in the "real gold" patterns of the Sacagawea "golden dollar" struck in 2000, Judd number 2190. Their whereabouts are now uncertain, but they are spectacular examples if still in existence. Below are tabulated all "non 13 star" patterns which I have identified, in the order of increasing Judd number, together with the denominations, dates, star counts, face and any pertinent comments. I hope this analysis helps numismatists studying this more esoteric specialty to better appreciate the artistic intent of the engravers.

If anyone has further insight on the star numbers, additions to the list, or other insights please contact me at jhm@ix.netcom.com. I would be delighted to hear from you.

NON "13 STAR" U.S. PATTERN COINS AND THEIR SIGNIFICANCE

TYPE A	THE STATES	IN	UNION	DURING	YEAR COINED
TYPE B	A STATES	ORDER	IN	RATIFYING	CONSTITUTION
TYPE C	A STATES	ORDER	IN	JOINING UNION	AFTER THE CONSTITUTION WAS RATIFIED
TYPE D	THE STATES	IN	UNION	AT START	OF LEWIS AND CLARK EXPEDITION IN 1804
TYPE E	PROBABLY	ARTISTIC	LICENSE		
TYPE F	PROBABLY	MINT	ERROR		

<u>CLICK ON</u> <u>JUDD NUMBER(S)</u>	<u>U.S. PATTERN</u> <u>UNDERLINED OBV</u> <u>DENOMINATION</u>	<u>COINS</u> <u>OR REV</u> <u>DATE</u>	<u>FACE</u> <u>STARS</u>	<u>FOR IMAGE</u> <u>FACE</u> <u>REV</u>	<u>TYPE</u>	<u>COMMENTS</u>
17	HALF DOLLAR	1794	14	REV	A	
19	DOLLAR	1794	15	REV	A	

UNITED STATES PATTERN COINS DEVIATING FROM "THE RULE OF 13 STARS"

21	HALF DIME	1795	15	OBV	A	
23	HALF EAGLE	1795	15	OBV	A	
25	EAGLE	1797	16	OBV	A	
58-9	DOLLAR	1836	26	<u>REV</u>	A	GOBRECHT
60	DOLLAR	1836	26	REV	A	GOBRECHT
61-2	DOLLAR	1836	26	<u>REV</u>	A	GOBRECHT
88-9	DOLLAR	1838	26	REV	A	GOBRECHT
108-9	DOLLAR	1839	26	REV	A	GOBRECHT
119-24	CENT	1850	2	<u>OBV</u>	E	
124a-h	CENT	1850	2	OBV	E	
152a	CENT	1850	2	<u>OBV</u>	E	
POLLOCK 145	CENT	1850	2	<u>OBV</u>	E	
305-8	TWO CENT	1863	2	OBV	E	
309-11	TWO CENT	1863	2	OBV	E	
643-6	DIME	1868	1	<u>REV</u>	E	
742-7	HALF DOLLAR	1869	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
747-753a	HALF DOLLAR	1869	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
754-759a	HALF DOLLAR	1869	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
963-968	HALF DOLLAR	1870	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
969-974	HALF DOLLAR	1870	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
975-80	HALF DOLLAR	1870	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
981-986	HALF DOLLAR	1870	2	<u>REV</u>	E	

UNITED STATES PATTERN COINS DEVIATING FROM "THE RULE OF 13 STARS"

987-992	HALF DOLLAR	1870	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1195-97	QUARTER	1872	2	REV	E
1200-1202	HALF DOLLAR	1872	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1223	TRADE DOLLAR	1872	2	REV	E
1245-7	TEN DOLLAR	1872	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1250-52	TWENTY DOLLAR	1872	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1253-54	TWENTY DOLLAR	1872	2	REV	E
1281-84	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1285-86	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1288	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1289	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1290-92	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1293-98	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1299	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1300-03	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1304	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1307	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1308-9	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1310-14	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1315-19	TRADE DOLLAR	1873	2	REV	E
1354-56	TWENTY CENT	1874	2	<u>REV</u>	E

1396-98	TWENTY CENT	1875	2	REV	E
1399-1402	TWENTY CENT	1875	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1407-10	TWENTY CENT	1875	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1411-13	TWENTY CENT	1875	2	REV	E
1414-15	TWENTY CENT	1875	2	REV	E
1454	TWENTY CENT	1876	2	REV	E
1503	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1504-5	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1508-9	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1510-11	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1526-7	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1530-31	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1532-3	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1534a, 1534	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1537-8	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1539, 1539a	HALF DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1542	DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1543	DOLLAR	1877	2	<u>REV</u>	E
1550a 1550b	DOLLAR	1878	2	REV	E
1550-1	DOLLAR	1878	2	<u>REV</u>	E

UNITED STATES PATTERN COINS DEVIATING FROM "THE RULE OF 13 STARS"

1552-3	DOLLAR	1878	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
1554-56	DOLLAR	1878	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
1557-9	DOLLAR	1878	38	<u>REV</u>	A	"GOLOID"
1560-62	DOLLAR	1878	2	<u>REV</u>	E	"GOLOID"
1563-4	DOLLAR	1878	38	<u>REV</u>	A	"GOLOID"
1565	DOLLAR	1878	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
1579-80	TEN DOLLAR	1878	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
1615-16	DOLLAR	1879	2	<u>REV</u>	E	
1626-30	DOLLAR	1879	38	<u>REV</u>	A	"GOLOID"
1631-4	DOLLAR	1879	38	<u>REV</u>	A	"GOLOID"
1635-7	FOUR DOLLAR	1879	1	<u>REV</u>	E	"STELLA"
1638-41	FOUR DOLLAR	1879	1	<u>REV</u>	E	"STELLA"
1651-3	DOLLAR	1880	38	<u>REV</u>	A	"GOLOID"
1654-6	DOLLAR	1880	38	<u>REV</u>	A	"GOLOID"
1657-1659	FOUR DOLLAR	1880	1	<u>REV</u>	E	"STELLA"
1660-62	FOUR DOLLAR	1880	1	<u>REV</u>	E	"STELLA"
1702-3	DOLLAR	1882	2	REV	E	
1703a	DOLLAR	1882	2	REV	E	
1731	DOLLAR	1884	2	REV	E	
1731a	DOLLAR	1884-O	2	REV	E	
1747-9	DOLLAR	1885	2	REV	E	
1750	DOLLAR	1885	2	REV	E	

1901-3	TEN DOLLAR	1907	46	EDGE	A	
1905-6	TWENTY DOLLAR	1907	46	OBV	A	
1907-10	TWENTY DOLLAR	1907	46	OBV	A	
1914-15	TWENTY DOLLAR	1907	46	OBV	A	
1914-15	TWENTY DOLLAR	1907	46	OBV	A	
1917	TWENTY DOLLAR	1907	46	OBV	A	
2190	DOLLAR STRUCK IN GOLD	2000	17	REV	D	"GOLDEN" DOLLAR